

**Independent Internal Review Report On Actual
CAF –ICAP Result-RAR - 9th Nov, 2021-Session
Sep, 2021.**



Submitted to:

The CEO SKANS School of Accountancy & RAR (CA) Management.

Submitted by:

Shuja Ali Khan
Office of the Director Governance and R&D
SKANS, School of Accountancy
Islamabad.

Date: December 1st, 2021

Table of Contents

1. Cover Letter	3
2. Basis of the Report:	3
3. The purpose of this review is to achieve the following objectives:	3
4.Executive Summary:	4
5.Table of Papers Comparison CAF-Sept and Mar-2021.	5
6. Rating of observations	6
7. Classification of observations	7
8. Independent Internal Review Report On Actual ICAP Result On 9th Nov 2021- Session Sep 2021	8
9. Below is the summary of observations:	9
10. Update on previously reported matters:	14
11. Closing Remarks	15
12. Annexures	16
13. Other Guidelines:	17

1. Cover Letter

This is an independent internal review which is carried out by the Director Governance office on the actual ICAP result (**CAF-Sept-2021**), RAR CAMPUS which was declared on 9th Nov 2021 for the session Sep,2021 by the ICAP.

2. Basis of the Report:

Basis of Assumptions:

- 1) Current assignment is to carry out review and comments on the ICAP actual (CAF Sep-2021) result compiled by the CA-Exam Department (RAR- Campus).
- 2) No verification could be carried out (due to non-availability of proper references regarding the tables of data-base and scope of work).

3. The purpose of this review is to achieve the following objectives:

- **Timeliness:** regarding compilation of ICAP Result (in Data-base) entries were made after 8 days of ICAP results (17-11-2021 to 24-11-2021) as referred Date of submitted in data-base and other faculty members may be followed the same practice. Whereas as per policy /sops it must be done on the same day or within maxi 2 days. Not only this but also, submission of “The Content Report” on ICAP Result (CAF RAR) was not made on time. It was submitted by the Exam department dated 29-11-2021 whereas as per policy it must be submitted within 7-10 days OR as per new directives (Sir Sadiq), in case of RAR result review it must be submitted within 2-3 days (Ref: The Content Report June 2021 RAR AFC Remarks by “Sir Sadiq”)
- **Transparency:** it is a system-based actual ICAP result which shows high level of transparency.
- **Comparability:** Not yet applicable on similar scale. But It can be compared with March 2021 CAF result.
- **Verifiability:** 100% variables can be verifiable.

RAR-Sep-2021 ICAP Result

MAJOR FINDINGS

4.Executive Summary:

This session sept-2021 CAF RAR total papers were appeared in the strength report 853(Last session March 2021-902 Papers) in numbers. Out of which 64 papers were adjusted on account of Freeze-drop cases. The above mentioned adjustment was made after the CAF mar-2021 result as per policy with the prior approval of FD. 789 papers were shown in the data-base as output but due to ICAP allowed exemption in ITA and IEF net papers which have been accounted for the result are 462 in total.

Six (6) variables are identified, which is less than from last session. In last session there were ten (10) variables. Number of bad variables are seven (7) (Other than Pass and fail) out of which four (4) are uncontrollable and three (3) are adjustable variables.

There is one Merit of Certificate in IEF. Teacher name is Miss Mehwish Raja.

Overall Pass result is 25% and excluding ITA and IEF it is 36% (last Session 24%).

As compared to last session result:

- There is a direct reduction of 9% in Controllable variables (Invalid CRN, Password changed, Result Not Found and GHOST).
- There is a favorable decrease of 14 % in Zero-Attempt in ICAP Variable.

Overall Fail result is 21% (last session :33%) and excluding ITA and IEF it is 36%.

As compared to last session result:

- 38% increase in ICAP exemption variable due to transition.
- Post Result drop variable has unfavorable increase of 3%.

There in Non-Compliance of LP Hours. (Approved 100 hours)

Unstructured/Unplanned Manual CAF Testing was performed.

- Number of less variables.
- Merit of Certificate in IEF.
- Over all Pass result 36%. (Gross Basis)
- Over all fail Result 36%. (Gross basis)
- Other Variables 28%. (Gross basis)
- Direct 9% reduction in controllable variables.
- Favorable decrease in Zero-Attempt in ICAP variable trend by 14%.
- Post Result drop variable trend has unfavorable trend by 3%.
- 38% increase in ICAP exemption variable due to transition.
- Non-compliance of LP Hours. (100 hours)
- Unstructured /Unplanned Manual CAF Testing.
- Non-compliance of submission of content report on expected ICAP CAF result-sept-2021.
- Less/No frequency of teacher evaluation.
- No make ups in order to fill the gap due to leaves of Teachers.
- Lack of follow ups
- Late submission of content report.
- Less commentary on teacher results.
- Boiler plate remarks of HOA and ITD.

SKANS (RAR) - Independent Internal Review Report on Actual ICAP Result On 9th

Nov 2021-Session Sept 2021 pg. 4

There is Non-Compliance of submission of content report on expected ICAP CAF Result-Sep-2021.

Frequency of Teacher Evaluation is very low.

There are no Make ups in order to fill the gap due to leaves of Teachers.
Lack of all type of follow-ups.

Late submission of Content Report.





There is less commentary on teacher results.

Boiler plate remarks of HOA and ITD are used in the content report.

5. Table of Papers Comparison CAF-Sept and Mar-2021.

	CAF-MAR-2021	CAF-SEPT-2021	WITHOUT(ITA+IEF)	CAF-MAR-2021	CAF-SEPT-2021	WITHOUT(ITA+IEF)	
PASS	219	198	167	24%	25%	36%	
Invalid CRN	19	0	0	2%	0%	0%	2%
Ineligible	31	26	26	3%	3%	6%	0%
Password changed	41	0	0	5%	0%	0%	5%
Post Result Drop	36	53	53	4%	7%	11%	3%
Result Not Found	7	0	0	1%	0%	0%	1%
Zero Attempt In ICAP	160	30	30	18%	4%	6%	-14%
Absent	84	19	19	9%	2%	4%	
GHOST	8	0	0	1%	0%	0%	1%
FAIL	297	167	167	33%	21%	36%	
ICAP Exemption	0	296	0	0%	38%	0%	38%
ICAP TOTAL PAPERS	902	789	462	100%	100%	100%	
SYSTEM-DROP FREEZE	0	64	64	0%	8%	14%	
LEFT	0	0	0	0%	0%	0%	0%
OUT-PUT	902	853	526	100%	108%	114%	8%

6. Rating of observations

-  **High** Matters considered to be fundamental to maintenance of internal control, good corporate governance or best practice for systems, processes, policies and directives. These matters should be subject to agreed remedial action within seven (7) days and also applicable for on-going academic activities for the current session March-2022.
-  **Medium** Matters considered to be of major importance to maintenance of internal control, good corporate governance or best practice for processes. These matters should be subject to agreed remedial action within one (1) month and also applicable for on-going academic activities for the current session March-2022.
-  **Low** Matters considered to be of minor importance to maintenance of internal control, good corporate governance or best practice for processes. Matter may warrant consideration for improving the efficiency of existing processes. Matter may warrant consideration for improving the efficiency of existing processes. These matters should be subject to further evaluation in next report AFC (Fast Track) December-2021/March-2022 attempt-PRC and CAF (2-4) months and also applicable for on-going academic activities for the current session March-2022.
-  **Future** Applicable for on-going session Dece-2021 and Mar-2022.

7. Classification of observations

Compliance framework 2021



Presentation



Content Report



System and processes



Testing



Variables Identification



Analysis



8. Independent Internal Review Report On Actual ICAP Result On 9th Nov 2021-Session Sep 2021

Director Governance Office could manage to undertake a reasonable review of the Actual ICAP Result AFC (RAR) which was declared on 9th Nov 2021.




The review's scope includes Report on Actual ICAP Result (hereinafter referred to as "The Content Report" on Actual CAF ICAP Result") prepared in accordance with the Policies/SOPS/Directives (Dated 15-12-2020), (15 03-2021) and 10th April 2021 respectively.



It is the prime responsibility of the management of SKANS School of Accountancy RAR for the preparation and presentation of the report in accordance with the Policies / SOPS/and directives as stated above. The responsibility includes ensuring that relevant steps have been duly fulfilled as stated in the main policy (Dated 15-12-2020 ICAP Result Compilation Policy) and SOPs and Directives.








9. Below is the summary of observations:


S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description
1	●	Compliance framework 2021	Submission of Expected ICAP result	as per sop	Not submitted the expected result of CAF
2	●	Compliance framework 2021	Submission of Expected ICAP result Content Report CAF	as per sop	Not submitted the expected result of CAF Content report
3	●	Compliance framework 2021	Submission of Actual ICAP result	2-3 days	Result was declared on 9 th Nov,2021 whereas content report was submitted on 29/11/2021
4	●	Compliance framework 2021	Low attendance and Post-result drop etc.	7 th -JULY-2018 policy	Management totally ignored. However , it can be applied for such mention cases “over the period”
5	●	Compliance framework 2021	Lecture Plan		Weak Lecture Plan Compliance in many/few cases only 55-70 hours were delivered whereas as per standard hours 100 hour
6	●	Compliance framework 2021	Make ups and refresher courses.	one-month before	Must be conducted in order to fill any gap. (standard hours)
7	●	Compliance framework 2021	Teachers' Evaluation	3-4 times	Missing in the report at CAF level.


S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1	●	Compliance framework 2021	CRN	15 days before the ICAP Exam	Status of CRN in the Data-base for the upcoming December ICAP FAST Track Exams	Applicable for upcoming results
2	●	Compliance framework 2021	Submission of Expected ICAP result	same day	Put Expected ICAP result as per directives dated 30/11/2021-Fast Track AFC	15th December 2021 single day. All results of fast Track .
3	●	Compliance framework 2021	Submission of Content Report on Expected ICAP result	as per sop	Prepare and Submit the Content Report on Expected ICAP results fast track AFC December 2021.	25th December 2021
4	●	Compliance framework 2021	Lecture Plan	100 hours	Weak Lecture Plan Compliance in many/few cases only 55-70 hours were delivered whereas as per standard hours 100 hour	Applicable for December Fast Track four batches and Mar.2022.
5	●	Compliance framework 2021	Make ups and refresher courses.	one-month before	Must be conducted in order to fill any gap. (standard hours)	Applicable for December Fast Track four batches and Mar.2022.
6	●	Compliance framework 2021	Adjustment of data-base at fraction.	as per policy 7-july-2018	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Left cases • Freeze drop cases • Drop cases • Post result drop cases • Low Attendance/Low performance cases 	As per new directives 26th Nov,2021.Still no replay of the mail.


S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Compliance framework 2021	Check-list		Compliance Check List is missing.	Track of all dates relevant to ICAP Expected and Actual Dates (meetings on results compilation). Must present at the end of Report. (for future ref)
2		Compliance framework 2021	Statement of Compliance by the accounts department.		Not provided	DGO has given in the case of June AFC-F-8 ICAP Result for future ref. (sample attached)
3		Compliance framework 2021	Statement of Compliance by the IT department.		Not provided	DGO has given in the case of June AFC-F-8 ICAP Result for future ref.(sample attached)


S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Presentation	Title page		Title of the report is missing.	Theme is missing.
2		Presentation	Tables and graphs in logical manners.		Not presented as per model. (REF: CAF-Mar-2021-F-8 CONTENT REPORT) UPLOADED IN PORTAL	Page#20-42



S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Content Report	Uploading in the portal		All old Content reports yet to be uploaded in the portal.	Zartashai please follow up.
1		Content Report	Referencing		Proper Table referencing is missing in the report.	
2		Content Report	Remarks -Teachers		Not matching with the teachers' results numbers and descriptive remarks which were given by the relevant teachers	
3		Content Report	Remarks -HOA		Traditional remarks "boiler plate"	General remarks
4		Content Report	Remarks -ITD		Traditional remarks "boiler plate"	General remarks
5		Content Report	About the report section.		About the report section is missing.	
1		Content Report	Back Flash		Comments or Remarks on the Last Report as given by CEO on ICAP CAF Result if any.	Back flash on the last report is missing.


S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		System and Processes.	Topics(Planned Vs. Actual)	As per new directives of Sir Sadiq dated: 29/11/2021.	Needs to follow.	• Class attendance.
				• After warning start deducting salary of who are habitual.		• Time In-Out
				• Please put securities around system.		• LP marked
						• Coordinators Remarks

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Testing	Manual Testing	• 5 class test	Very Weak Manual CAF Testing.	• Proper Class test attendance.
				• 1 mid-term		• Proper Class test paper.
				• 1 Mock		• As per LP.
				• OLH after each chapters (if available)		• Share the result with CEO at the end of each Manual Class tests.

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Variables Identification	ADJUSTABLE VARIABLES		• Post Results Drops (53 papers).	However, other variables can also be adjustable under the policy of low attendance 7-7-2018 and 26 th Nov,2021 directives ref: data-base adjustment at fraction.
					• Ineligible (26 papers)	
					• Drop-freeze (64 papers) (done)	

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Variables Identification	Uncontrollable Variables	During this session four uncontrollable variables were also identified.	• Absent in ICAP (19 papers)	These can be well settled if management + Teachers will have a very “Strong Loop” with the students.
					• Zero Attempt in ICAP (30 papers)	At the time of submission of ICAP Exam form.
					• Ineligible (26 Papers)	
					• ICAP Exemption (296 papers)	

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Research Contribution			Needs to follow.	For future ref and present this information in the upcoming content reports.
S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Teacher Level Testing			Needs to follow.	As per SOPs. And present in the upcoming content reports.

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Analysis	Comparison		Comparison from last session (march-CAF-2021) is missing.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Last session-CAF-MAR-2021 • Last period same session-Sept-2020

10. Update on previously reported matters:

Classification

	HIGH	MED	LOW	Future
Observations identified during current session	10	6	11	5
Observations identified in prior session	NA	NA	NA	NA
Total open observations	NA	NA	NA	NA
Total closed observations	NA	NA	NA	NA

11. Closing Remarks

In our opinion the “The Content Report” on Actual ICAP Result for the RAR session ended Sept 2021 CAF in all material respects describes fairly, the activities undertaken during the session, demonstrate 36%-**50% compliance** by the management RAR.

Overall conclusion is good and in accordance with the requirement of the said Policies, SOPS and directives as stated otherwise in this full review.

(Annexures have been attached/provided in the main Content Report-CAF-RAR-Sept-2021) by the RAR Management.

Shuja Ali Khan

Office of the Director Governance and R&D
SKANS, School of Accountancy

Dated: 1-12-2021

12. Annexures

For future ref only.

		Reference	Date
1	Independent Review Report shared with Principal	Non-compliance	16 th April 2021
2	Directive issued by Governance on the compilation of result	Non-compliance	10 th April 2021
3	Pull filtered excel sheets subject-wise 7 days before the ICAP Exams by the coordinators and send to teachers?	Non-compliance	10 th April 2021
4	2 days before the ICAP results conduct meeting with the faculty by the HOA and Manager Exam?	No comments	5 th April 2021
5	Checklist prepared and submit to Compile the ICAP Result (to the reviewer) (meeting)	No comments	10 th April 2021
6	2 days before ICAP result PPT Slides are to be shared for guideline to compile result with the teachers (in the meeting)	No comments	11 th April 2021
7	Declaration of ICAP Result	Ok	12 th April 2021
8	Reviewed the Observed variables other than pass, fail.	No comments	14 th April 2021
9	Submit the Content Report and final meeting with the Principal within 10 days by the HOA/VP	No comments	28 th April 2021
10	Will the campus be able to compile the result on the same day?	Possible 90% if data-base has been adjusted as per policy or at fraction	12 th April 2021

13. Other Guidelines:

Note:

- 1) Try to put the result from ICAP PDF files 90%
- 2) E-sheets will be available on next day
- 3) From E-sheet you can get the following information
 - a) Absent
 - b) ICAP paper Cancelled
 - c) Zero Attempts
 - d) Fail Marks or just put 10 marks in the system
- 2) In case of password changed use strong loop concept at coordination levels and teachers level
- 3) IT Department needs to introduce new variable” Result Awaiting in the Review application” and put all those entries in that caption. (please do not stop the process)
- 4) This head will be triggered in the case of password changed/E sheets unavailable. (again create strong loop with your students, so students can share the results with you along with E-sheets)
- 5) Review all Content Reports from the portal.
- 6) Review all policies/Sops/Directives in order to Compile the Results. (from the Portal)
- 7) Please do serious efforts in the process of compilation of system based ICAP Results. (Out of the Box)