Independent Internal Review Report On Actual CAF –ICAP Result-ST - 9th Nov, 2021-Session Sep, 2021.

Submitted to:
The Principal SKANS School of Accountancy & ST (CA) Management.

Submitted by:
Shuja Ali Khan
Office of the Director Governance and R&D
SKANS, School of Accountancy
Islamabad.

Date: December 1st, 2021

Table of Contents

1. **Cover Letter** 3
2. **Basis of the Report:** 3
3. **The purpose of this review is to achieve the following objectives:** 3
4. **Executive Summary:** 4
5. **Table of Papers Comparison CAF-Sept and Mar-2021.** 5
6. **Table of Lecture Date Compliance CAF-Sept-2021** 6
7. **Rating of observations** 7
8. **Classification of observations** 8
9. **Independent Internal Review Report On Actual ICAP Result On 9th Nov 2021-Session Sep 2021** 9
10. **Below is the summary of observations:** 10
11. **Update on previously reported matters:** 15
12. **Closing Remarks** 16
13. Annexures 17
14. **Other Guidelines:** 18

1. Cover Letter

This is an independent internal review which is carried out by the Director Governance office on the actual ICAP result **(CAF-Sept-2021)**, ST CAMPUS which was declared on 9th Nov 2021 for the session Sep,2021 by the ICAP.

2. Basis of the Report:

Basis of Assumptions:

1) Current assignment is to carry out review and comments on the ICAP actual (CAF Sep-2021) result compiled by the CA-Exam Department (ST- Campus).
2) No verification could be carried out (due to non-availability of proper references regarding the tables of data-base and scope of work).

3. The purpose of this review is to achieve the following objectives:

- **Timeliness:** regarding compilation of ICAP Result (in Data-base) entries were made after 5 days of ICAP results (16-11-2021 to 24-11-2021) as referred Date of submitted in data-base and other faculty members may be followed the same practice. Whereas as per policy /sops it must be done on the same day or within maxi 2 days. Not only this but also, submission of "The Content Report" on ICAP Result (CAF ST) was not made on time. It was submitted by the Exam department dated 19-11-2021 whereas as per policy it must be submitted within 7-10 days OR as per new directives (Sir Sadiq), in case of ST result review it must be submitted within 2-3 days (Ref: The Content Report June 2021 ST AFC Remarks by "Sir Sadiq")
- **Transparency:** it is a system-based actual ICAP result which shows high level of transparency.
- **Comparability:** Not yet applicable on similar scale. But It can be compared with March 2021 CAF result.
- **Verifiability:** 100% variables can be verifiable.

ST-Sep-2021 ICAP Result

4.Executive Summary:

This session sept-2021 CAF ST total papers were appeared in the strength report 80 (Last session March 2021-76 Papers) in numbers. 80 papers were shown in the data-base as output but due to ICAP allowed exemption in ITA and IEF net papers which have been accounted for the result are 64 in total.

Nine (9) variables are identified, which is equal to the last session. In last session there were nine (9) variables. Number of bad variables are seven (7) (Other than Pass and fail) out of which two (2) are uncontrollable and five (5) are adjustable variables.

Overall Pass result is 19% and excluding ITA and IEF it is 23% (last Session 28%).

As compared to last session result:

- There is a direct reduction of 11% in Controllable variables (ineligible, Password changed, Result awaiting).

Overall Fail result is 33% (last session :30%) and excluding ITA and IEF it is 41%.

As compared to last session result:

- 25% increase in ICAP exemption variable due to transition.
- Post Result drop variable has favorable decrease of 2%.

There in Non-Compliance of LP Hours. (Approved 100 hours) in very few cases as report attached table #6.

Unstructured/Unplanned Manual CAF Testing was performed.

Timely submission of content report on expected ICAP CAF Result- Sep-2021.

MAJOR FINDINGS

- Very Good Compliance of LP in relative term .
- Timely submission of expected ICAP result.
- Timely submission of expected ICAP result Content report.
- Timely submission of Actual ICAP result Content report in relative term.
- Positive Management Tone towards the TPA report 100% for march-2021 session.
- Over all Pass result 23%. (Gross Basis)
- Over all fail Result 41%. (Gross basis)
- Other Variables 44%. (Gross basis)
- Direct 11% reduction in controllable variables.
- Post Result drop variable trend has favorable trend by 2%.
- 25% increase in ICAP exemption variable due to transition.
- Good-compliance of LP Hours. (100 hours) in relative terms
- Unstructured /Unplanned Manual CAF Testing.
- Less/No frequency of teacher evaluation. (lack of information "UNMARKED COLUMN" not reported")
- No make ups in order to fill the gap due to leaves of Teachers.
- Lack of follow ups

Frequency of Teacher Evaluation is very low and do not reflect the true position due to non-availability of "NOT MARKED COLUMN" and reference of Table.

There are no Make ups in order to fill the gap due to leaves of Teachers.
Lack of all type of follow-ups.

There is good commentary on teacher results.

Boiler plate remarks of HOA and ITD are used in the content report.

- Good commentary on teacher results.
- Boiler plate remarks of HOA and ITD.

5.Table of Papers Comparison CAF-Sept and Mar-2021.

Variables	CAF-MAR-2021	CAF-SEPT-2021	WITHOUT(ITA+IEF)	CAF-MAR-2021	CAF-SEPT-2021	WITHOUT(ITA+IEF)
Absent	11	5	5	14%	6%	8%
Fail	23	26	26	30%	33%	41%
Pass	21	15	15	28%	19%	23%
Drop	1	3	3	1%	4%	5%
Post Result Drop	6	4	4	8%	5%	6%
Zero Attempt in ICAP	6	5	5	8%	6%	8%
Left	0	4	4	0%	5%	6%
Low Attendance	0	2	2	0%	3%	3%
Ineligible	2	0	0	3%	0%	0%
Password changed	3	0	0	4%	0%	0%
Result Awaiting	3	0	0	4%	0%	0%
ICAP Exemption	0	16	0	0%	20%	0%
Total	76	80	64	100%	100%	100%
ICAP Exemption	0	0	16	0%	0%	25%
Grand Total	**76**	**80**	**80**	**100%**	**100%**	**125%**

6. Table of Lecture Date Compliance CAF-Sept-2021

Lecture Date Compliance Report-Sept-2021 CAF						
Paper	**Batch**	**Teacher**	**Total**	**Presents**	**Absents**	**Short Duration**
Ali Sufian			Hours	Hours		
ITA	1	Ali Sufian	63	63		
FAR1	1	Ali Sufian	80	80		
FAR2	1	Ali Sufian	78	78		
CMA	1	Ali Sufian	78	78		
Khaliq Ul Rehman						
IEF	1	Khaliq Ul Rehman	62	62		
BMBS	2	Khaliq Ul Rehman	87	87		
IEF	2	Khaliq Ul Rehman	44	44		
Khayyam Javaid						
TAX	1	Khayyam Javaid	84	84		
AUD	1	Khayyam Javaid	88	88		
ITA	2	Khayyam Javaid	68	68		
BMBS	1	Sadia Shabbir	90	90		
Shehla Yasmin						
BL	1	Shehla Yasmin	63	63		
Source: Lecture Date Compliance report-sept-2021-skans database						

7. Rating of observations

High Matters considered to be fundamental to maintenance of internal control, good corporate governance or best practice for systems, processes, policies and directives. These matters should be subject to agreed remedial action within seven (7) days and also applicable for on-going academic activities for the current session March-2022.

Medium Matters considered to be of major importance to maintenance of internal control, good corporate governance or best practice for processes. These matters should be subject to agreed remedial action within one (1) month and also applicable for on-going academic activities for the current session March-2022.

Low Matters considered to be of minor importance to maintenance of internal control, good corporate governance or best practice for processes. Matter may warrant consideration for improving the efficiency of existing processes. These matters should be subject to further evaluation in next report AFC (Fast Track) December-2021/March-2022 attempt-PRC and CAF (2-4) months and also applicable for on-going academic activities for the current session March-2022.

Future Applicable for on-going session Dece-2021 and Mar-2022.

8. Classification of observations

Compliance framework 2021

Presentation

Content Report

System and processes

Testing

Variables Identification

Analysis

9. Independent Internal Review Report On Actual ICAP Result On 9th Nov 2021-Session Sep 2021

Director Governance Office could manage to undertake a reasonable review of the Actual ICAP Result AFC (ST) which was declared on 9th Nov 2021.

The review's scope includes Report on Actual ICAP Result (hereinafter referred to as "The Content Report" on Actual CAF ICAP Result") prepared in accordance with the Policies/SOPS/Directives (Dated 15-12-2020), (15 03-2021) and 10th April 2021 respectively.

It is the prime responsibility of the management of SKANS School of Accountancy ST for the preparation and presentation of the report in accordance with the Policies / SOPS/and directives as stated above. The responsibility includes ensuring that relevant steps have been duly fulfilled as stated in the main policy (Dated 15-12-2020 ICAP Result Compilation Policy) and SOPs and Directives.

10. Below is the summary of observations:

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description
1		Compliance framework 2021	Submission of Actual ICAP result	2-3 days	Result was declared on 9th Nov,2021 whereas content report was submitted on 19/11/2021
2		Compliance framework 2021	Low attendance and Post-result drop etc.	7th -JULY-2018 policy	Management totally ignored. However , it can be applied for such mention cases “over the period”
3		Compliance framework 2021	Lecture Plan	100 Hours	Weak Lecture Plan Compliance in many/few cases only 55-90 hours were delivered whereas as per standard hours 100 hour
4		Compliance framework 2021	Make ups and refresher courses.	one-month before	Must be conducted in order to fill any gap. (standard hours)
5		Compliance framework 2021	Focus On	(Very Critically in New Session)	ITA-FAR1 and CMA (Conduct special Courses/Extra Time)
6		Compliance framework 2021	Teachers' Evaluation	3-4 times	Missing “UNMARKED COLUMN “ in the report at CAF level.

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Compliance framework 2021	CRN	15 days before the ICAP Exam	Status of CRN in the Data-base for the upcoming December ICAP FAST Track Exams	Applicable for upcoming results
2		Compliance framework 2021	Submission of Expected ICAP result	same day	Put Expected ICAP result as per directives dated 2/12/2021-Fast Track AFC	15th December 2021 single day. All results of fast Track .
3		Compliance framework 2021	Submission of Content Report on Expected ICAP result	as per sop	Prepare and Submit the Content Report on Expected ICAP results fast track AFC December 2021.	25th December 2021
4		Compliance framework 2021	Lecture Plan	100 hours	Weak Lecture Plan Compliance in many/few cases only 55-70 hours were delivered whereas as per standard hours 100 hour	Applicable for December Fast Track four batches and Mar.2022.
5		Compliance framework 2021	Make ups and refresher courses.	one-month before	Must be conducted in order to fill any gap. (standard hours)	Applicable for December Fast Track four batches and Mar.2022.
6		Compliance framework 2021	Adjustment of data-base at fraction.	as per policy 7-july-2018	• Left cases • Freeze drop cases • Drop cases • Post result drop cases • Low Attendance/Low performance cases	As per new directives 26th Nov,2021.Still no replay of the mail.

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Compliance framework 2021	Check-list		Compliance Check List is missing.	Track of all dates relevant to ICAP Expected and Actual Dates (meetings on results compilation). Must present at the end of Report. (for future ref)
2		Compliance framework 2021	Statement of Compliance by the accounts department.		Not provided	DGO has given in the case of June AFC-F-8 ICAP Result for future ref. (sample attached)
3		Compliance framework 2021	Statement of Compliance by the IT department.		Not provided	DGO has given in the case of June AFC-F-8 ICAP Result for future ref.(sample attached)

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Presentation	Title page		Title of the report is missing.	Theme is missing.
2		Presentation	Tables and graphs in logical manners.		Not presented as per model. (REF: CAF-Mar-2021-F-8 CONTENT REPORT) UPLOADED IN PORTAL	Page#33 to 42

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Content Report	Uploading in the portal		All old Content reports yet to be uploaded in the portal.	Zartashai please follow up.
1		Content Report	Referencing		Proper Table referencing is missing in the report.	
2		Content Report	Remarks -Teachers		Not matching with the teachers' results numbers and descriptive remarks which were given by the relevant teachers	
3		Content Report	Remarks -HOA		Traditional remarks "boiler plate"	General remarks
4		Content Report	Remarks -ITD		Traditional remarks "boiler plate"	General remarks
5		Content Report	About the report section.		About the report section is missing.	May not be informed
1		Content Report	Back Flash		Comments or Remarks on the Last Report as given by CEO on ICAP CAF Result if any.	Back flash on the last report is missing.

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		System and Processes.	Topics(Planned Vs. Actual)	As per new directives of Sir Sadiq dated: 29/11/2021.	Needs to follow.	• Class attendance.
				• After warning start deducting salary of who are habitual.		• Time In-Out
				• Please put securities around system.		• LP marked
						• Coordinators Remarks

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Testing	Manual Testing	• **5 class test**	Very Weak Manual CAF Testing.	• **Proper Class test attendance.**
				• **1 mid-term**		• **Proper Class test paper.**
				• **1 Mock**		• **As per LP.**
				• **OLH after each chapters (if available)**		• **Share the result with CEO at the end of each Manual Class tests.**

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Variables Identification	ADJUSTABLE VARIABLES	ZERO	• Left (4 papers).	
					• Post Results Drops (4 papers).	However, other variables can also be adjustable under the policy of low attendance 7-7-2018 and 26th Nov,2021 directives ref: data-base adjustment at fraction.
					• Drop (3 papers)	
					• Low Attendance (2 papers)	

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Variables Identification	Uncontrollable Variables	During this session three uncontrollable variables were also identified.	• Absent in ICAP (5 papers)	These can be well settled if management + Teachers will have a very **"Strong Loop"** with the students.
					• Zero Attempt in ICAP (5 papers)	At the **time** of **submission of ICAP Exam form.**
					• Ineligible (0 Papers)	
					• ICAP Exemption (16 papers)	

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Research Contribution			Needs to follow.	For future ref and present this information in the upcoming content reports.
S#	**Risk grading**	**Classification**	**Sub-class**	**Bench Mark**	**Short description**	**Reference**
1		Teacher Level Testing			Needs to follow.	As per SOPs. And present in the upcoming content reports.

S#	Risk grading	Classification	Sub-class	Bench Mark	Short description	Reference
1		Analysis	Comparison		Comparison from last session (march-CAF-2021) is missing.	• **Last session-CAF-MAR-2021** • **Last period same session-Sept-2020**

11. Update on previously reported matters:

Classification

	HIGH	MED	LOW	Future
Observations identified during current session	10	6	11	5
Observations identified in prior session	NA	NA	NA	NA
Total open observations	NA	NA	NA	NA
Total closed observations	NA	NA	NA	NA

12. Closing Remarks

In our opinion the "The Content Report" on Actual ICAP Result for the ST session ended Sept 2021 CAF in all material respects describes fairly, the activities undertaken during the session, demonstrate 23%-**35% compliance** by the management ST.

Overall conclusion is below average and in accordance with the requirement of the said Policies, SOPS and directives as stated otherwise in this full review.

S#			
1	TPA(Report Compliance-to-date (basis on last week) for the March session-2022.	Very Good	97 to 99%
2	Online Classes.	>50%	
3	ICAP transition.		
4	Health issues.	High	Due care
5	Research Contribution (relatively) at PRC level.	Medium	
6	Positive Management Tone.	Very High	
7	Teacher Level Testing .	Low	
8	Identification of variables and arrangement of data .	Medium	

(Annexures have been attached/provided in the main Content Report-CAF-ST-Sept-2021) by the ST Management.

_____

Shuja Ali Khan
Office of the Director Governance and R&D
SKANS, School of Accountancy
Dated: 1-12-2021

13. Annexures

For future ref only.

		Reference	Date
1	Independent Review Report shared with Principal	Non-compliance	16th April 2021
2	Directive issued by Governance on the compilation of result	Non-compliance	10th April 2021
3	Pull filtered excel sheets subject-wise 7 days before the ICAP Exams by the coordinators and send to teachers?	Non-compliance	10th April 2021
4	2 days before the ICAP results conduct meeting with the faculty by the HOA and Manager Exam?	No comments	5th April 2021
5	Checklist prepared and submit to Compile the ICAP Result (to the reviewer) (meeting)	No comments	10th April 2021
6	2 days before ICAP result PPT Slides are to be shared for guideline to compile result with the teachers (in the meeting)	No comments	11th April 2021
7	Declaration of ICAP Result	Ok	12th April 2021
8	Reviewed the Observed variables other than pass, fail.	No comments	14th April 2021
9	Submit the Content Report and final meeting with the Principal within 10 days by the HOA/VP	No comments	28th April 2021
10	Will the campus be able to compile the result on the same day?	Possible 90% if data-base has been adjusted as per policy or at fraction	12th April 2021

14. Other Guidelines:

Note:

1) Try to put the result from ICAP PDF files 90%
2) E-sheets will be available on next day
3) From E-sheet you can get the following information
   a) Absent
   b) ICAP paper Cancelled
   c) Zero Attempts
   d) Fail Marks or just put 10 marks in the system

2) In case of password changed use strong loop concept at coordination levels and teachers level
3) IT Department needs to introduce new variable" Result Awaiting in the Review application" and put all those entries in that caption. (please do not stop the process)
4) This head will be triggered in the case of password changed/E sheets unavailable. (again create strong loop with your students, so students can share the results with you along with E-sheets)
5) Review all Content Reports from the portal.
6) Review all policies/Sops/Directives in order to Compile the Results. (from the Portal)
7) Please do serious efforts in the process of compilation of system based ICAP Results. (Out of the Box)