# ***Independent Internal Review Report On Actual CAF –ICAP Result-RAR - 9th Nov, 2021-Session Sep, 2021.***

**Submitted to:**
The CEO SKANS School of Accountancy & RAR (CA) Management.

**Submitted by:**
Shuja Ali Khan
Office of the Director Governance and R&D
SKANS, School of Accountancy
Islamabad.

**Date: December 1st, 2021**

# Table of Contents


1. **Cover Letter** ..... 3

2. **Basis of the Report:** ..... 3

3. **The purpose of this review is to achieve the following objectives:** ..... 3

**4.Executive Summary:** ..... 4

**5.Table of Papers Comparison CAF-Sept and Mar-2021.** ..... 5

**6. Rating of observations** ..... 6

7. **Classification of observations** ..... 7

8. **Independent Internal Review Report On Actual ICAP Result On 9th Nov 2021-Session Sep 2021** ..... 8

**9. Below is the summary of observations:** ..... 9

**10. Update on previously reported matters:** ..... 14

**11. Closing Remarks** ..... 15

12. Annexures ..... 16

**13. Other Guidelines:** ..... 17

## 1. Cover Letter

This is an independent internal review which is carried out by the Director Governance office on the actual ICAP result **(CAF-Sept-2021)**, RAR CAMPUS which was declared on 9th Nov 2021 for the session Sep,2021 by the ICAP.

## 2. Basis of the Report:

**Basis of Assumptions:**

1) Current assignment is to carry out review and comments on the ICAP actual (CAF Sep-2021) result compiled by the CA-Exam Department (RAR- Campus).
2 ) No verification could be carried out (due to non-availability of proper references regarding the tables of data-base and scope of work ).

## 3. The purpose of this review is to achieve the following objectives:

- **Timeliness:** regarding compilation of ICAP Result (in Data-base) entries were made after 8 days of ICAP results (17-11-2021 to 24-11-2021) as referred Date of submitted in data-base and other faculty members may be followed the same practice. Whereas as per policy /sops it must be done on the same day or within maxi 2 days. Not only this but also, submission of "The Content Report" on ICAP Result (CAF RAR) was not made on time. It was submitted by the Exam department dated 29-11-2021 whereas as per policy it must be submitted within 7-10 days OR as per new directives (Sir Sadiq), in case of RAR result review it must be submitted within 2-3 days (Ref: The Content Report June 2021 RAR AFC Remarks by "Sir Sadiq")
- **Transparency:** it is a system-based actual ICAP result which shows high level of transparency.
- **Comparability:** Not yet applicable on similar scale. But It can be compared with March 2021 CAF result.
- **Verifiability:** 100% variables can be verifiable.

## 4.Executive Summary:

This session sept-2021 CAF RAR total papers were appeared in the strength report 853(Last session March 2021-902 Papers) in numbers. Out of which 64 papers were adjusted on account of Freeze-drop cases. The above mentioned adjustment was made after the CAF mar-2021 result as per policy with the prior approval of FD. 789 papers were shown in the data-base as output but due to ICAP allowed exemption in ITA and IEF net papers which have been accounted for the result are 462 in total.

Six (6) variables are identified, which is less than from last session. In last session there were ten (10) variables. Number of bad variables are seven (7) (Other than Pass and fail) out of which four (4) are uncontrollable and three (3) are adjustable variables.

There is one Merit of Certificate in IEF. Teacher name is Miss Mehwish Raja.

Overall Pass result is 25% and excluding ITA and IEF it is 36% (last Session 24%).

As compared to last session result:

- There is a direct reduction of 9% in Controllable variables (Invalid CRN, Password changed, Result Not Found and GHOST).
- There is a favorable decrease of 14 % in Zero-Attempt in ICAP Variable.

Overall Fail result is 21% (last session :33%) and excluding ITA and IEF it is 36%.

As compared to last session result:

- 38% increase in ICAP exemption variable due to transition.

- Post Result drop variable has unfavorable increase of 3%.

There in Non-Compliance of LP Hours. (Approved 100 hours)

Unstructured/Unplanned Manual CAF Testing was performed.

**MAJOR FINDINGS**

- Number of less variables.
- Merit of Certificate in IEF.
- Over all Pass result 36%. (Gross Basis)
- Over all fail Result 36%. (Gross basis)
- Other Variables 28%. (Gross basis)
- Direct 9% reduction in controllable variables.
- Favorable decrease in Zero-Attempt in ICAP variable trend by 14%.
- Post Result drop variable trend has unfavorable trend by 3%.
- 38% increase in ICAP exemption variable due to transition.
- Non-compliance of LP Hours. (100 hours)
- Unstructured /Unplanned Manual CAF Testing.
- Non-compliance of submission of content report on expected ICAP CAF result-sept-2021.
- Less/No frequency of teacher evaluation.
- No make ups in order to fill the gap due to leaves of Teachers.
- Lack of follow ups
- Late submission of content report.
- Less commentary on teacher results.
- Boiler plate remarks of HOA and ITD.

There is Non-Compliance of submission of content report on expected ICAP CAF Result-Sep-2021.

Frequency of Teacher Evaluation is very low.

There are no Make ups in order to fill the gap due to leaves of Teachers.
Lack of all type of follow-ups.

Late submission of Content Report.

There is less commentary on teacher results.

Boiler plate remarks of HOA and ITD are used in the content report.

## 5.Table of Papers Comparison CAF-Sept and Mar-2021.

| | CAF-MAR-2021 | CAF-SEPT-2021 | WITHOUT(ITA+IEF) | CAF-MAR-2021 | CAF-SEPT-2021 | WITHOUT(ITA+IEF) | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| **PASS** | 219 | 198 | 167 | **24%** | **25%** | **36%** | | |
| **Invalid CRN** | 19 | 0 | 0 | **2%** | **0%** | **0%** | 2% | |
| **Ineligible** | 31 | 26 | 26 | **3%** | **3%** | **6%** | | 0% |
| **Password changed** | 41 | 0 | 0 | **5%** | **0%** | **0%** | 5% | |
| **Post Result Drop** | 36 | 53 | 53 | **4%** | **7%** | **11%** | | 3% |
| **Result Not Found** | 7 | 0 | 0 | **1%** | **0%** | **0%** | 1% | |
| **Zero Attempt In ICAP** | 160 | 30 | 30 | **18%** | **4%** | **6%** | | -14% |
| **Absent** | 84 | 19 | 19 | **9%** | **2%** | **4%** | | |
| **GHOST** | 8 | 0 | 0 | **1%** | **0%** | **0%** | **1%** | |
| **FAIL** | 297 | 167 | 167 | **33%** | **21%** | **36%** | | |
| ICAP Exemption | 0 | 296 | 0 | **0%** | **38%** | **0%** | | 38% |
| **ICAP TOTAL PAPERS** | **902** | **789** | **462** | **100%** | **100%** | **100%** | | |
| **SYSTEM-DROP FREEZE** | 0 | 64 | 64 | **0%** | **8%** | **14%** | | |
| **LEFT** | 0 | 0 | 0 | **0%** | **0%** | **0%** | 0% | |
| **OUT-PUT** | **902** | **853** | **526** | **100%** | **108%** | **114%** | 8% | |

## 6. Rating of observations

| | |
|---|---|
| **High** | Matters considered to be fundamental to maintenance of internal control, good corporate governance or best practice for systems, processes, policies and directives. These matters should be subject to agreed remedial action within seven (7) days and also applicable for on-going academic activities for the current session March-2022. |
| **Medium** | Matters considered to be of major importance to maintenance of internal control, good corporate governance or best practice for processes. These matters should be subject to agreed remedial action within one (1) month and also applicable for on-going academic activities for the current session March-2022. |
| **Low** | Matters considered to be of minor importance to maintenance of internal control, good corporate governance or best practice for processes. Matter may warrant consideration for improving the efficiency of existing processes. These matters should be subject to further evaluation in next report AFC (Fast Track) December-2021/March-2022 attempt-PRC and CAF (2-4) months and also applicable for on-going academic activities for the current session March-2022. |
| **Future** | Applicable for on-going session Dece-2021 and Mar-2022. |

## 7. Classification of observations

Compliance framework 2021

Presentation

Content Report

System and processes

Testing

Variables Identification

Analysis

## 8. Independent Internal Review Report On Actual ICAP Result On 9th Nov 2021-Session Sep 2021

Director Governance Office could manage to undertake a reasonable review of the Actual ICAP Result AFC (RAR) which was declared on 9th Nov 2021.

The review's scope includes Report on Actual ICAP Result (hereinafter referred to as "The Content Report" on Actual CAF ICAP Result") prepared in accordance with the Policies/SOPS/Directives (Dated 15-12-2020), (15 03-2021) and 10th April 2021 respectively.

It is the prime responsibility of the management of SKANS School of Accountancy RAR for the preparation and presentation of the report in accordance with the Policies / SOPS/and directives as stated above. The responsibility includes ensuring that relevant steps have been duly fulfilled as stated in the main policy (Dated 15-12-2020 ICAP Result Compilation Policy) and SOPs and Directives.

## 9. Below is the summary of observations:

| S# | Risk grading | Classification | Sub-class | Bench Mark | Short description |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Submission of Expected ICAP result | as per sop | Not submitted the expected result of CAF |
| | | | | | |
| 2 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Submission of Expected ICAP result Content Report CAF | as per sop | Not submitted the expected result of CAF Content report |
| | | | | | |
| 3 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Submission of Actual ICAP result | 2-3 days | Result was declared on 9th Nov,2021 whereas content report was submitted on 29/11/2021 |
| | | | | | |
| 4 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Low attendance and Post-result drop etc. | 7th -JULY-2018 policy | Management totally ignored. However , it can be applied for such mention cases “over the period” |
| | | | | | |
| 5 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Lecture Plan | | Weak Lecture Plan Compliance in many/few cases only 55-70 hours were delivered whereas as per standard hours 100 hour |
| | | | | | |
| 6 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Make ups and refresher courses. | one-month before | Must be conducted in order to fill any gap. (standard hours) |
| | | | | | |
| 7 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Teachers' Evaluation | 3-4 times | Missing in the report at CAF level. |

| S# | Risk grading | Classification | Sub-class | Bench Mark | Short description | Reference |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | | | |
| 1 | | Compliance framework 2021 | CRN | 15 days before the ICAP Exam | Status of CRN in the Data-base for the upcoming December ICAP FAST Track Exams | Applicable for upcoming results |
| | | | | | | |
| 2 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Submission of Expected ICAP result | same day | Put Expected ICAP result as per directives dated 30/11/2021-Fast Track AFC | 15th December 2021 single day. All results of fast Track . |
| | | | | | | |
| 3 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Submission of Content Report on Expected ICAP result | as per sop | Prepare and Submit the Content Report on Expected ICAP results fast track AFC December 2021. | 25th December 2021 |
| 4 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Lecture Plan | 100 hours | Weak Lecture Plan Compliance in many/few cases only 55-70 hours were delivered whereas as per standard hours 100 hour | Applicable for December Fast Track four batches and Mar.2022. |
| | | | | | | |
| 5 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Make ups and refresher courses. | one-month before | Must be conducted in order to fill any gap. (standard hours) | Applicable for December Fast Track four batches and Mar.2022. |
| | | | | | | |
| 6 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Adjustment of data-base at fraction. | as per policy 7-july-2018 | • Left cases<br>• Freeze drop cases<br>• Drop cases<br>• Post result drop cases<br>• Low Attendance/Low performance cases | As per new directives 26th Nov,2021.Still no replay of the mail. |

| S# | Risk grading | Classification | Sub-class | Bench Mark | Short description | Reference |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Check-list | | Compliance Check List is missing. | Track of all dates relevant to ICAP Expected and Actual Dates (meetings on results compilation). Must present at the end of Report. (for future ref) |
| | | | | | | |
| 2 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Statement of Compliance by the accounts department. | | Not provided | DGO has given in the case of June AFC-F-8 ICAP Result for future ref. (sample attached) |
| | | | | | | |
| 3 | | Compliance framework 2021 | Statement of Compliance by the IT department. | | Not provided | DGO has given in the case of June AFC-F-8 ICAP Result for future ref.(sample attached) |

| S# | Risk grading | Classification | Sub-class | Bench Mark | Short description | Reference |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | | Presentation | Title page | | Title of the report is missing. | Theme is missing. |
| | | | | | | |
| 2 | | Presentation | Tables and graphs in logical manners. | | Not presented as per model. (REF: CAF-Mar-2021-F-8 CONTENT REPORT) UPLOADED IN PORTAL | Page#20-42 |

| S# | Risk grading | Classification | Sub-class | Bench Mark | Short description | Reference |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | | Content Report | Uploading in the portal | | All old Content reports yet to be uploaded in the portal. | Zartashai please follow up. |
| | | | | | | |
| 1 | | Content Report | Referencing | | Proper Table referencing is missing in the report. | |
| | | | | | | |
| 2 | | Content Report | Remarks -Teachers | | Not matching with the teachers' results numbers and descriptive remarks which were given by the relevant teachers | |
| | | | | | | |
| 3 | | Content Report | Remarks -HOA | | Traditional remarks "boiler plate" | General remarks |
| | | | | | | |
| 4 | | Content Report | Remarks -ITD | | Traditional remarks "boiler plate" | General remarks |
| | | | | | | |
| 5 | | Content Report | About the report section. | | About the report section is missing. | |
| 1 | | Content Report | Back Flash | | Comments or Remarks on the Last Report as given by CEO on ICAP CAF Result if any. | Back flash on the last report is missing. |

| S# | Risk grading | Classification | Sub-class | Bench Mark | Short description | Reference |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | | System and Processes. | Topics(Planned Vs. Actual) | As per new directives of Sir Sadiq dated: 29/11/2021. | Needs to follow. | • Class attendance. |
| | | | | • After warning start deducting salary of who are habitual. | | • Time In-Out |
| | | | | • Please put securities around system. | | • LP marked |
| | | | | | | • Coordinators Remarks |

| S# | Risk grading | Classification | Sub-class | Bench Mark | Short description | Reference |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | | Testing | Manual Testing | • **5 class test** | Very Weak Manual CAF Testing. | • **Proper Class test attendance.** |
| | | | | • **1 mid-term** | | • **Proper Class test paper.** |
| | | | | • **1 Mock** | | • **As per LP.** |
| | | | | • **OLH after each chapters (if available)** | | • **Share the result with CEO at the end of each Manual Class tests.** |

| S# | Risk grading | Classification | Sub-class | Bench Mark | Short description | Reference |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | | | |
| 1 | | Variables Identification | ADJUSTABLE VARIABLES | | • Post Results Drops (53 papers). | However, other variables can also be adjustable under the policy of low attendance 7-7-2018 and 26th Nov,2021 directives ref: data-base adjustment at fraction. |
| | | | | | • Ineligible (26 papers) | |
| | | | | | • Drop-freeze (64 papers) (done) | |

| S# | Risk grading | Classification | Sub-class | Bench Mark | Short description | Reference |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 |  | Variables Identification | Uncontrollable Variables | During this session four uncontrollable variables were also identified. | • Absent in ICAP (19 papers) | These can be well settled if management + Teachers will have a very **"Strong Loop"** with the students. |
| | | | | | • Zero Attempt in ICAP (30 papers) | At the **time** of **submission of ICAP Exam form.** |
| | | | | | • Ineligible (26 Papers) | |
| | | | | | • ICAP Exemption (296 papers) | |

| S# | Risk grading | Classification | Sub-class | Bench Mark | Short description | Reference |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | | Research Contribution | | | Needs to follow. | For future ref and present this information in the upcoming content reports. |
| **S#** | **Risk grading** | **Classification** | **Sub-class** | **Bench Mark** | **Short description** | **Reference** |
| 1 | | Teacher Level Testing | | | Needs to follow. | As per SOPs. And present in the upcoming content reports. |

| S# | Risk grading | Classification | Sub-class | Bench Mark | Short description | Reference |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 1 | | Analysis | Comparison | | Comparison from last session (march-CAF-2021) is missing. | • **Last session-CAF-MAR-2021**<br>• **Last period same session-Sept-2020** |

## 10. Update on previously reported matters:

**Classification**

| | HIGH | MED | LOW | Future |
|---|---|---|---|---|
| Observations identified during current session | 10 | 6 | 11 | 5 |
| Observations identified in prior session | NA | NA | NA | NA |
| Total open observations | NA | NA | NA | NA |
| Total closed observations | NA | NA | NA | NA |

## 11. Closing Remarks

In our opinion the "The Content Report" on Actual ICAP Result for the RAR session ended Sept 2021 CAF in all material respects describes fairly, the activities undertaken during the session, demonstrate 36%-**50% compliance** by the management RAR.

Overall conclusion is good and in accordance with the requirement of the said Policies, SOPS and directives as stated otherwise in this full review.

(Annexures have been attached/provided in the main Content Report-CAF-RAR-Sept-2021) by the RAR Management.

_____

**Shuja Ali Khan**
Office of the Director Governance and R&D
SKANS, School of Accountancy
Dated: 1-12-2021

## 12. Annexures

**For future ref only.**

| | | Reference | Date |
|---|---|---|---|
| **1** | Independent Review Report shared with Principal | Non-compliance | 16th April 2021 |
| **2** | Directive issued by Governance on the compilation of result | Non-compliance | 10th April 2021 |
| **3** | Pull filtered excel sheets subject-wise 7 days before the ICAP Exams by the coordinators and send to teachers? | Non-compliance | 10th April 2021 |
| **4** | 2 days before the ICAP results conduct meeting with the faculty by the HOA and Manager Exam? | No comments | 5th April 2021 |
| **5** | Checklist prepared and submit to Compile the ICAP Result (to the reviewer) (meeting) | No comments | 10th April 2021 |
| **6** | 2 days before ICAP result PPT Slides are to be shared for guideline to compile result with the teachers (in the meeting) | No comments | 11th April 2021 |
| **7** | Declaration of ICAP Result | Ok | 12th April 2021 |
| **8** | Reviewed the Observed variables other than pass, fail. | No comments | 14th April 2021 |
| **9** | Submit the Content Report and final meeting with the Principal within 10 days by the HOA/VP | No comments | 28th April 2021 |
| **10** | Will the campus be able to compile the result on the same day? | Possible 90% if data-base has been adjusted as per policy or at fraction | 12th April 2021 |

## 13. Other Guidelines:

Note:

1) Try to put the result from ICAP PDF files 90%
2) E-sheets will be available on next day
3) From E-sheet you can get the following information
   a) Absent
   b) ICAP paper Cancelled
   c) Zero Attempts
   d) Fail Marks or just put 10 marks in the system

2) In case of password changed use strong loop concept at coordination levels and teachers level
3) IT Department needs to introduce new variable" Result Awaiting in the Review application" and put all those entries in that caption. (please do not stop the process)
4) This head will be triggered in the case of password changed/E sheets unavailable. (again create strong loop with your students, so students can share the results with you along with E-sheets)
5) Review all Content Reports from the portal.
6) Review all policies/Sops/Directives in order to Compile the Results. (from the Portal)
7) Please do serious efforts in the process of compilation of system based ICAP Results. (Out of the Box)